



KASIM REED
MAYOR

CITY OF ATLANTA
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
55 TRINITY AVENUE, S.W. SUITE 3350 – ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303
404-330-6145 – FAX: 404-658-7491
<http://www.atlantaga.gov/Government/Planning.aspx>

CHARLETTA WILSON JACKS
DIRECTOR
Office of Planning

STAFF REPORT
May 13, 2015

Agenda Item: Application for a Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-15-149) for alterations at **57 Forsyth Street (The Healey Building)** - Property is zoned SPI-1 (Subarea 7) /Landmark Building / Site.

Applicant: Thomas F. Little
675 Ponce de Leon Avenue

Facts: The Healey Building was designated as a Landmark Building in 1991. This property was renovated in 2001. As part of that renovation, the lower sashes of some of the windows were replaced to match the existing windows. In 2006, the Healey Building Home Owners Association (HOA) hired Wiss, Janney, Elstner (WJE) to do a window condition analysis on the whole building. WJE rated the windows as good, fair or poor. According to the WJE analysis at that time, 60% of the windows on the building were in poor condition. The Staff would note the specific definition of a poor window according to WJE was: “wood is not at all solid, with more than 1/8 inch of soft wood at the surface under paint on some or all parts of sash and frame. In place repair would involve scrape, repaint, reseal as well as some wood replacement.” This assessment was not specific to individual units or sets of windows.

Since that time the Staff has been working with the HOA, their design professionals, and Easements Atlanta, Inc. (which holds a façade easement against the building) on an approach to assess all of the windows in the building, develop a triage strategy to address the problems associated with the windows, and determine the best method to review the repair and/or replacement decision given the condominium ownership structure of the building.

Before the Commission at this time is a proposed approach to reviewing individual window repair and/or replacement decisions for all of the windows in the common areas of the building. The proposed decision making approach would not necessarily be applied to individual condominium unit windows, as the individual unit owners would be responsible for submitting an application and supporting rationale for the repair and/or replacement of their specific windows.

Analysis: The following code sections apply to this application:

Per Section 16-20.007 of the Atlanta Land Development Code, as amended:

- (a) **When Required, Generally:** In addition to other permits which are required pursuant to any city ordinance, and in addition to any certificate of appropriateness which may be required pursuant to any other landmark or historic building, site or district regulation contained in part 16 of the Code of Ordinances, certificates of appropriateness shall, unless provided otherwise in the detailed regulations governing Landmark or Historic Districts contained within a designation ordinance as provided in section 16-20.006 of the Code of Ordinances, be required for any of the following actions within each of the following categories:
- (1) Landmark buildings and sites:
 - a. To change the exterior appearance of any Landmark Building or Site;

Section 16-20.009:

In deciding individual applications for certificates of appropriateness, the commission shall be guided by the purposes set forth in section 16-20.001, by findings contained in ordinances designating buildings and sites for protection, for purposes and objectives contained in ordinances designating buildings and sites for protection, by purposes and objectives which are contained within individual Landmark and Historic District regulations, and by findings contained in reports prepared in support of Landmark and Historic regulations as are required in article D of chapter 4 or part 6. Furthermore, in considering whether to grant approval, conditional approval or denial of an application for a type II or type III certificate of appropriateness, the commission shall apply the following standards:

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure or site and its environment.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.
- (3) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
- (4) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object or site shall be kept where possible.
- (5) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.

While the Applicant's submission doesn't specifically request a repair and/or replacement decision on any specific window unit or window component, it does provide a "logic tree" to be used by the design / window professionals when making an individual assessment of each of the windows in the common area based on accepted historic preservation practices. This is outlined on page A9.00 of the plan set under "Scope of Work" and "Guidelines". This would allow for a common set of criteria to be applied to each repair / replacement decision and for a common repair / replacement technique to be used. This would result in a more orderly approach to the window work, likely a more consistent and cohesive visual result and significantly less application logistics for each individual window decision. The criteria set out four (4) levels of deterioration each with a prescribed response / solution.

A mock-up of each level of deterioration and each prescribed response will be approved by the Staff prior to its use on the common area windows. The Staff would not review each individual window decision.

Given the size of the building, the distance of the windows from the public street, the number of windows, and the condominium form of ownership, the Staff finds that the approach and criteria outlined in the submission are appropriate and meet the Landmark Building / Site regulations.

However, the Staff would recommend that in addition to the review of the mock-ups specified in CA2-15-149, the Staff conduct at least two site visits at the 30% and 60% stages of the common window replacement project to assess adherence to the assessment and decision making strategy outlined in the CA2-15-149. Further, the Staff would recommend that all window repair and/or replacement decisions for upper level windows at the Healey Building in common areas and in individual condominium units use the criteria and approach outlined in CA2-15-149 and the Staff shall be authorized to make the repair / replacement decision based on criteria and approach outlined in CA2-15-149.

Staff Recommendation: Based upon the following:

1. The proposed windows assessment, documentation, and repair / replacement decision process meets the Landmark Building / Site regulations, per Section 16-20.009.

Staff recommends approval of an application for an application for a Type II Certificate of Appropriateness (CA2-15-149) for alterations at **57 Forsyth Street (The Healey Building)** - Property is zoned SPI-1 (Subarea 7) /Landmark Building / Site, with the following condition:

1. In addition to the review of the mock-ups specified in CA2-15-149, the Staff shall conduct at least two site visits at the 30% and 60% stages of the common window replacement project to assess adherence to the assessment and decision making strategy outlined in the CA2-15-149, per Section 16-20.009; and
2. All window repair and/or replacement decisions for upper level windows at the Healey Building in common areas and in individual condominium units shall use the criteria and approach outlined in CA2-15-149 and the Staff shall be authorized to make the repair / replacement decision based on criteria and approach outlined in CA2-15-149.

Explanatory Note: The following are General Notes and Guidelines developed for the repair of the Healy Building's common area windows. The information contained herein may not be suitable for the repair of other windows. Healey Condominium homeowners should consult with their own design professional and/or contractor to develop specifications suitable for their unit windows and to ensure that they obtain the necessary approvals to perform any contemplated work.

GENERAL NOTES

1. All demolition work shall comply with the requirements NFPA 241 Standard for Safeguarding Construction, Alteration, and Demolition Operations.
2. Work shall comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, Rehabilitation: <http://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/four-treatments/treatment-rehabilitation.htm>
3. Notify the Association of any damage to the building structure discovered during construction activities.
4. Coordinate building access, construction hours, and elevator use with Association and building security.
5. Provide continuous tenant and homeowner access to elevators at all times.
6. No onsite parking is available for Contractor use.
7. By reference, Preservation Brief No. 9, The Repair of Historic Wooden Windows, is included as part of these Guidelines.
8. By reference, Preservation Brief No. 10 Paint Removal from Historic Woodwork, is included as part of these Guidelines.

BASE GUIDELINES FOR WORK

1. Remove existing sealant from perimeter of window frame; install new sealant at window perimeter, coordinate with painting work.
2. Remove all unsound glazing compounds and re-glaze windows. The existing glass is to remain unless cracked, broken, or otherwise scheduled for replacement.
3. Prepare wood windows for painting and paint exterior of all windows; Paint exterior of all windows with color to match existing (most work is anticipated to fall within Class II - with limited areas, such as sills, Class III - preparation work and painting as defined in Preservation Brief No. 10 Paint Removal from Historic Woodwork). Repainting does not necessarily require removal of all paint.
4. Repair of rotted or damaged wood components may include the following:
 - a. Class 1: Use of approved epoxy fillers for surface repairs, sealing seams and joints, wood checking (Preservation Brief No. 9: Repair Class 1)
 - b. Class 2: Use of approved epoxy fillers for damaged/decayed woods (Preservation Brief No. 9: Repair Class 2)
 - c. Class 3: Splicing in of new wood sections with new wood to match (Preservation Brief No. 9 Repair: Class 3).
 - d. Complete replacement of wood sash.

- e. Provide mock-ups of proposed repair methods for Architect review prior to commencement of work.
5. Replacement components shall match existing in profile and pattern.
6. Re-glaze Windows: "Wet set" glass in continuous bead of specified sealant prior to installation of wood glazing stop.
7. Coordinate repair work with paint stripping and painting to avoid exposing bare wood to further damage.
8. Install new sheet metal sill pan flashing at locations of complete sill or window replacement; confirm existing conditions in field.
9. Replace missing or deteriorated blocking at locations of wood window frame replacement or window replacement; replace using treated wood blocking of appropriate sizes.

GUIDELINES FOR WORK

1. Wood window replacement components shall use windows installed in 2009 and approved by the AUDC and EAI as a general guideline for replacement and repair work.
2. Replacement window units shall be installed with sashes fixed in position.
3. Exterior profiles of any replacement components shall match profiles of the existing component being replaced.
4. Broken or cracked glass shall be replaced.
5. Any new glass installed shall be clear
6. Internally-mounted storm windows may be installed at window units.
7. Exterior paint colors to match existing colors.
8. Acceptance of a completed mock-up is required prior to proceeding with the remainder of the project.
9. Applicable industry standards include:
 - a. ANSI/WDMA I.S. 2-93. Wood Windows
 - b. AWWPA: Book of Standards
10. Provide shop drawings of window components scheduled for replacement. Confirm existing dimensions and profiles in field and reflect field measurements and conditions in shop drawings.
11. Existing Mockup, east elevation: This mockup has been reviewed by the AUDC and Easements Atlanta, Inc., and shall be used as an example of acceptable workmanship. Contact the Association for information regarding the location of these windows.

Repair and Replacement Guidelines for Wood Windows (Reference Preservation Brief No. 9, The Repair of Historic Wooden Windows):

- **Level 1.** If any wood component exhibits less than approximately 25% deterioration requiring repair with epoxy fillers or replacement of section(s) with new wood, that component shall be repaired using appropriate methods.
- **Level 2.** If any wood component exhibits more than approximately 25% deterioration requiring repair with epoxy fillers or replacement of section(s) with new wood, that component shall be replaced with a new wood component to preserve the structural integrity of the window.
- **Level 3.** If an individual sash (upper or lower) is identified with more than 2 components (stiles or rails) requiring replacement, repair or substantial repair with epoxy fillers, that sash shall be

replaced with a new wood sash to match the existing in exterior profile to preserve structural integrity of the window.

- Level 4. If an individual window unit (including frame, sash and trim components) requires replacement of more than 50% of wood components, then the entire window unit may be replaced to preserve the integrity of the building envelope.